

Suggested Answer Key

1. From paragraph 1, what criticisms does the author make of institutions that present themselves as custodians of cultural heritage? (2m)

From the passage		Suggested answer	Mark
Small wonder, then, that governments, international bodies, and cultural institutions have rushed to position themselves as its custodians. (lines 1-3)	A	[Hasty/Impulsive] The author criticises that these institutions acted on impulse / without much thought /they acted too quickly/too eagerly . OR [INF] The author criticises that these institutions acted opportunistically .	1
But custodianship implies responsibility to the people whose heritage is being protected and unfortunately, the record of those institutions is considerably less flattering than their <u>promotional materials</u> would suggest. (lines 4-6)	B	[Actual record vs promoted image] [INF] The actual record showed that they had fallen far short of the expectation to protect the heritage of the peoples that was <u>set out in the promotional materials</u> . OR The actual record of heritage protection was far less impressive than <u>the image they presented</u> to the public. OR [INF] They may have exaggerated / oversold their plans to protect cultural heritage in <u>their promotional materials</u> . <i>Note: The gap between what was promised and reality must be present</i>	1

2. How does the example of Angkor Wat in paragraph 2 support the author's assertion in the last sentence of paragraph 1? (3m)

From the passage		Suggested answer	Mark
... the government began removing <u>thousands</u> of families who had lived within the complex for generations. (lines 9-10)	A	It supports the assertion by showing that A <u>multitude</u> of families who were long-term residents were made to leave/evicted .	1m for each (A, B and C1/C2)
Officials arrived with short deadlines ... (line 11)	B	They were given little time to relocate ...	
... and meagre <u>compensation</u> (line 11)	C1	and were poorly reimbursed for the homes they lost. OR and only received very little reimbursement for the homes they lost.	

OR ... and the unspoken warning that those who <u>lingered</u> would receive nothing at all. (lines 12-13)		<i>Note: meaning of 'meagre' (very little, or unfairly low) must be captured</i>	
	C2	Additionally, it was implied that those who <u>delayed leaving</u> risked receiving no compensation at all/would be denied any compensation/not obtain compensation at all . <i>Note: Mention of unspoken warning alone, without context supporting idea that the govt/international orgs have failed their responsibility, is insufficient</i>	

3. In paragraph 3, what similarities does the author draw between the experiences of the communities in the UNESCO-listed Ngorongoro Conservation Area and Panama City's Casco Viejo district? (2m)

From the passage		Suggested answer	Mark
[Ngorongoro] ... UNESCO ... explicitly acknowledging their right to remain and promising to safeguard their <u>interests</u> . (lines 15-17)	A	[Guaranteed Benefits] One similarity is that both communities that lived there received strong assurances that they would <u>gain</u> from heritage conservation / their heritage would be <u>protected</u> .	1m
[Casco Viejo] ... World Heritage listing guaranteed benefits to the residents ... (lines 20-21)			
[Ngorongoro] Within decades ... <u>departure</u> felt less like a choice than a foregone conclusion. (lines 17-19)	B	[Unavoidable Displacement] Another similarity is that heritage conservation resulted in the unavoidable <u>displacement</u> of local communities.	1m
[Casco Viejo] Yet, it resulted in the inevitable <u>eviction</u> of the working-class families ... (lines 21-22)			

For internal circulation only

4. How does the author illustrate that only ‘things that could be photographed, packaged, and sold’ (line 37) are prioritised over ‘lived experiences’ (line 38)? Support your answer using **one** example from Paragraph 4.

From the passage		Suggested answer	Mark
[About Casco Viejo] What was preserved immaculately however, was only the façade . (lines 31)	A1	[What was preserved: façade] This was illustrated in how ... What was preserved in Casa Viejo was only the exterior of buildings ... OR (INF) architecture ...	2m or nothing
Residents who were evicted spoke not only of the neighbourhood's colonial architecture but also of the social fabric they had built across generations ... (lines 28-29)	A2	[What was valued: social fabric] and not the relational ties/ties between people .	

OR

[About Ngorongoro] However, what was protected, and promoted to the world, was merely the view . (lines 35-36)	B1	[What was preserved: scenery] In Ngorongoro, what was preserved was only the scenery	2m or nothing
Instead, they spoke of a way of life shaped by intimate knowledge of grazing routes and the landscape accumulated over centuries. (lines 33-35)	B2	[What was valued: way of life] and not the people's lifestyle/manner of living .	

5. Explain how lines 40-46 support the author's assertion that ‘what passes for preservation is often something closer to theatre’? (lines 39-40) (2m)

From the passage		Suggested answer	Mark
folk dances ... performed on a nightly <u>schedule</u> for hotel guests... (lines 41-42)	A	Traditional dance showcases are staged as <u>regular</u> performances for tourists.	Any 2 for 2m
... and sacred festivals reduced to <u>ticketed</u> spectacles on an events calendar. (lines 42-43)	B	Hallowed/Holy festivals have turned into <u>paid</u> entertainment/shows . <i>Note: Do not accept “events”</i>	
Worryingly, some governments routinely dramatise whichever <u>aspects of a culture</u> bolster an approved national story... (lines 43-44)	C	Governments embellish/exaggerate <u>cultural elements</u> that support state-endorsed narratives.	

6. Summarise the author's views on why cultural heritage matters and the threats it faces.
Write your summary in **no more than 120 words**.

From the passage	Pt	Suggested paraphrase
... is what makes us <u>who we are</u> . (line 2) OR ... it is the foundation of <u>identity</u> . (lines 9-10) OR ... its members know <u>where they come from</u> (lines 10-11)	A	[FORMS IDENTITY] Heritage gives people a collective <u>sense of self</u> ,
and can find <u>meaning in where they are collectively going</u> . (lines 11-12) OR a community that loses its shared history <u>struggles to articulate a shared future</u> . (lines 21-22)	B	[PROVIDES SHARED DIRECTION] helps them <u>find purpose</u> in their <u>common future</u> , OR helps communities <u>shape a shared future</u> .
... communities <u>stripped of their cultural moorings</u> tend to fracture (lines 12-13) OR those that retain them tend to <u>hold together</u> even under the most severe external pressure. (lines 13-14)	C	[STRENGTHENS SOCIAL COHESION] [INF] and <u>prevents group fragmentation</u> . OR <u>Without culture</u> , societies may fragment . OR <u>keeps communities united</u> despite the gravest outside threats.
Heritage also functions as a repository of <u>collective knowledge</u> . (lines 14-15)	D	[PRESERVES SHARED KNOWLEDGE] It stores/preserves <u>shared knowledge</u> .
Through cultural traditions, later generations also <u>inherit</u> knowledge about <u>how to live in a particular landscape</u> , <u>sustain unique crafts</u> , or <u>navigate social relationships</u> . (lines 15-17)	E	[TRANSMITS PRACTICAL KNOWLEDGE / SKILLS] [INF] Additionally, <u>practical/useful know-how/wisdom</u> is <u>passed on</u> .
... the preservation of heritage promotes dialogue <u>between communities</u> . (lines 17-18)	F	[ENCOURAGES INTERCULTURAL EXCHANGE] It encourages meaningful discussions /exchange of ideas <u>among communities</u> .
... <u>fosters mutual understanding</u> in ways that textbooks alone cannot achieve. (lines 18-19)	G	[ENCOURAGES INSIGHTS CONCERNING OTHERS] and <u>builds deeper insight of each other</u> that formal education alone cannot.
<u>In war zones</u> , heritage sites are <u>frequently targeted</u> ... (lines 20-21)	H	[WAR ATTACKS HERITAGE SITES] Heritage sites are <u>often attacked</u> during armed <u>conflicts</u> .
<u>Climate change</u> poses an equally serious, if less visible, danger. Rising sea levels ... are eroding physical sites at an <u>accelerating rate</u> ... (lines 22-24)	I	[CLIMATE CHANGE ERODES PHYSICAL HERITAGE] <u>Environmental changes increasingly damage</u> heritage locations,

... <u>forcing</u> communities whose understanding of those places has been built up over centuries to abandon them. (lines 24-26)	J	[CLIMATE CHANGE FORCES PEOPLE TO LEAVE] which <u>compels</u> communities to leave .
<u>Globalisation</u> exerts a subtler but no less corrosive pressure ... traditional <u>crafts</u> become <u>economically unviable</u> (lines 26-28)	K	[GLOBALISATION REDUCES ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF HERITAGE] <u>Globalisation</u> causes traditional <u>crafts</u> to become <u>economically unsustainable</u> .
<u>Globalisation</u> exerts a subtler but no less corrosive pressure... younger generations find <u>less reason to engage with inherited ways of life</u> (lines 26-29)	L	[GLOBALISATION UNDERMINES YOUNG PEOPLE'S INTEREST IN THEIR HERITAGE] Globalisation leads to young people <u>losing interest</u> in <u>tradition/culture</u> . Note: Globalisation to be captured in K or L
Finally, there is the threat of simple <u>neglect</u> ... OR when <u>governments</u> face <u>competing priorities</u> , <u>cultural heritage budgets</u> are among the first to be <u>cut</u> (lines 29-31) OR ... a choice that reveals something about how such governments rank <u>what endures</u> against <u>what is merely urgent</u> . (lines 31-32)	M	[LACK OF GOVERNMENT SUPPORT COMPARED TO OTHER PRIORITIES] Lastly, <u>governments ignore/disregard</u> cultural heritage. OR <u>governments withdraw funding for heritage</u> when resources are <u>scarce</u> . OR [INF] Lastly, <u>governments</u> give <u>heritage lower priority</u> in the face of <u>pressing</u> concerns.

Points	1-2	3-4	5	6	7	8	9	≥10
Marks	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8

Sample Summary

Cultural heritage matters because it gives people a collective sense of self^A, helping communities find purpose in their common future^B. It also keeps them united despite the gravest external threats^C. Additionally, it **preserves** shared knowledge^D and practical wisdom is passed on^E. Furthermore, it encourages meaningful **discussions**^F and builds deeper insights of each other that formal education alone cannot^G. However, heritage sites are often attacked during armed conflicts^H. Environmental changes increasingly **damage** heritage locations^I, which compels communities to **leave**^J. Moreover, globalisation causes traditional crafts to become economically unsustainable^K, and leads to young people losing interest in tradition^L. Lastly, governments give heritage lower priority in the face of pressing concerns. (13 points, 109 words)

For internal circulation only

7. Passage 1 argues that who gets to decide how to preserve cultural heritage is ‘almost never the communities themselves’ (lines 49-50).

Identify **one** specific idea from Passage 3 which can be used to undermine this statement. Justify your answer. [2]

Pt	From Passage 3	Suggested answer	Mark
	[Main Idea expressed in lines 49-50] The communities themselves <u>did not have the agency</u> to determine what and how heritage is preserved.		
A	The community had chosen for <u>itself</u> which traditions to honour, and how the gathering would unfold. (lines 14-15)	<u>Identify</u> The idea from Passage 3 found in lines 14-15 is that the writer’s community elected <u>on their own</u> to preserve its cultural tradition.	1m
B	Justification But word had spread among the Kerala community through a WhatsApp message and a Facebook post, and by mid-morning several women had gathered in our kitchen, bearing some of the ingredients my mother had requested... All it took was a personal message passed between friends, ingredients gathered from different shops, and the knowledge my mother had carried with her over the years.	<u>Justify</u> This suggests that communities can act independently because they can <u>leverage their informal networks/social media platforms</u>. Note: students have to clarify how the agency is achieved.	1m

8. Passage 2 suggests that cultural heritage is the ‘foundation of identity’ (lines 9-10).

Identify **one** specific idea from Passage 3 which can be used to support this statement.
Justify your answer. [2]

Pt	From Passage 3	Suggested answer	Mark
	[Main idea expressed in lines 7-8] A sense of heritage allows individuals/communities to have an understanding of their past.		
A	When I stood beside her in our kitchen and learned to make some of the traditional dishes, adjusting everything by instinct, I understood...I was <u>tracing a path back to Kerala</u> through memory and ritual of my childhood (lines 7-8)	[Idea of cultural knowledge/exposure and its significance to one’s roots] Identify Found in lines 4-5 or 7-8, the author’s knowledge/remembrance of her culture’s food practices <u>helped her discover who she was.</u>	1m
B	Justification Why is cultural heritage foundational to our identity?	[Explaining how the idea in A demonstrates that culture is a key element of one’s identity] [INF] This supports the claim in Passage 2 because this strengthened her sense of connection to her family’s origin/past, hence her desire to return to these rituals practiced since she was young. OR [INF] This supports the claim in Passage 2 because the sensory experience of traditional food preparation provides strong emotional anchors to one’s core identity. <i>Accept any reasonable answer</i>	1m

OR

Pt	From Passage 3	Suggested answer	Mark
	[Main idea expressed in lines 9-10] A sense of heritage allows individuals/communities to have a connection to their ethnic origin		
A	“...and my mother made sure that I <u>understood the traditions</u> behind it even as a child... (ln 1-3)	[Idea of cultural knowledge/exposure and significance to one’s roots] Identify Found in lines 1-3, the author’s mother placed much <u>importance</u> in passing down their Indian <u>culinary tradition</u> to her.	1m

B	Justification Why is cultural heritage foundational to our identity? “Throughout my early days in Coventry, England, the sadya was a fixture of our family celebrations...” (ln 1-2)	[Explaining how idea in A demonstrates that culture is a key element of one’s identity] [INF] This supports the claim in Passage 2 because this helped the author appreciate the importance of such traditions to her identity (as seen by viewing it has a legacy she needs to pass on) <i>Accept any reasonable answer</i>	1m
---	---	--	----

9. The reading passages cover a range of views about the value and preservation of cultural heritage.

How far do you agree that we should be concerned about cultural heritage? (12m)

Support your answer with reference to:

- the ideas and opinions from **at least** one of the reading passages
- examples drawn from your own experience and that of your society.

Sample Evaluation and Explanation

Passage/ Para	Author argues that	Possible areas of evaluation
Passage 1, lines 39-40	“...what passes for preservation is often something closer to theatre ”	<u>DISAGREE:</u> Possible EV + Examples • The plethora of ways in both government and community groups seek to safeguard elements of our cultural heritage suggests that efforts are not merely for show. Having moved from developing to developed nation status fairly rapidly, the modernising landscape can be disorientating and risks eroding our sense of place, not to mention identity. • The sheer pace of development Singapore’s urban landscape has undergone, exacerbated by severe land constraints, means that our social memory struggles to keep pace with urban transformation, as iconic spaces and physical landmarks like the Old National Library, Kallang National Stadium, and Dakota Crescent are demolished to make space for new buildings and infrastructure. • Additionally, our rapid modernisation has also put severe pressure on traditional crafts and ways of life, as industrialisation and the drive for efficiency, and a pragmatic education model leave aging artisans without affordable spaces or

For internal circulation only

		young successors to inherit their trades. This is precisely the reason why stakeholders here make concerted efforts to safeguard building and practices of cultural importance, recognising they have a grounding effect on local communities to whom they matter and the average Singaporean alike.
Passage 2, lines 29-30	“Finally, there is the threat of simple neglect ...”	<u>DISAGREE: Possible examples + EV</u> - Far from ignoring cultural preservation, the government recognises the need to balance development and cultural protection, especially given our land constraints and challenges associated with the continuation of cultural trades. To that end, the government has gazetted a significant number of culturally significant buildings including the Sri Mariamman temple and Thian Hock Keng temple—thus protecting them from the threat of demolition despite our land scarcity, and also means that their restoration is subject to governmental oversight, ensuring their cultural character is not altered by modern enhancements, as seen from how the approved restoration of Sri Mariamman temple not only retained its original colours but involved the hiring of numerous metal and wood artisans from India. - Many cultural trades are helmed by older individuals who are artisans more than savvy entrepreneurs, and hence sometimes lack the know-how to make their crafts known to a younger generation who may not even know they exist. Recognising these challenges, National Heritage Board’s SG Heritage Business scheme provides traditional artists with tailored support such as business consultancy services as well as involves them in heritage festivals to publicise their services to both Singaporeans and international tourists. The targeted nature of these initiatives suggests that the state is fully committed to protecting heritage instead of ignoring it. - Even if one is critical of governmental efforts as tokenistic, the same cannot be said for ground up efforts given the local organisations behind them emerge out of passion and concern that governmental measures are not sufficient. For instance, community volunteers formed the Kampong Gelam Alliance, using social media to publicise the Ramadan bazaar and other Malay/Muslim cultural events taking place in the district; they have also brought their worries about gentrification edging out heritage restaurants and helped those at risk of being displaced by new businesses to find new premises within the district.

